



CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE

Approved
MEETING MINUTES
CITY OF FORT LAUDERDALE
AFFORDABLE HOUSING ADVISORY COMMITTEE
FIRE STATION #2, 528 NW 2ND STREET
3RD FLOOR CONFERENCE ROOM
FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA 33311
MONDAY, SEPTEMBER 11, 2023 – 9:00 A.M.

Cumulative

Committee Members	Attendance	Present	Absent
Margi Nothard, Chair	P	8	1
Leann Barber, Vice Chair	P	9	0
Vice Mayor Dr. Pamela Beasley-Pittman (10:10)	P	9	0
Pablo Calvo (9:31)	P	4	0
William Condon	P	8	1
Willie McKay	A	2	1
Sister Robin Merrill	P	2	2
Susan Spragg	P	9	0
Solomon Williams	A	3	3
Ryan Wipplinger	P	7	2

Staff

Avis Wilkinson, Assistant Housing and Community Development Manager / SHIP Administrator / Staff Liaison
Carla Blair, Recording Secretary, Prototype, Inc.

Communication to the City Commission

None.

I. ROLL CALL / DETERMINATION OF A QUORUM

Chair Nothard called the meeting to order at 9:11 a.m. Roll was called and it was noted a quorum was present.

Caroline Cozzi, representing Habitat for Humanity of Broward, was present as a guest at the meeting.

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – August 14, 2023

Ms. Spragg noted that Chair Nothard had expressed interest in increasing the minimum size of accessory dwelling units (ADUs) from 600 sq. ft. to 750 sq. ft., and requested clarification that this was accurate. Chair Nothard confirmed that this had been her statement.

Motion made by Ms. Spragg, seconded by Mr. Condon, to approve. In a voice vote, the **motion** passed unanimously.

III. OLD BUSINESS

- **Affordable Housing Trust Fund Balance – Avis A. Wilkinson**

Ms. Wilkinson reported that the Affordable Housing Trust Fund balance remains at \$0, although funds are expected in this account in the future.

- **Affordable Housing Incentive Plan update – City Commission October 17, 2023**

Ms. Wilkinson recalled that the Committee had originally planned to take a final vote to approve the Affordable Housing Incentive Plan at today's meeting; however, notice of the public hearing was not posted. For this reason, the final review, public hearing, and vote will be taken at the Committee's October 9, 2023 meeting. The City Commission will receive the Affordable Housing Incentive Plan at their October 17, 2023 meeting.

The following Item was taken out of order on the Agenda.

- **Habitat BBI Village groundbreaking held September 9, 2023**

Ms. Wilkinson reported that the groundbreaking ceremony for Habitat for Humanity of Broward's BBI Village was well-attended. BBI Village will provide 20 town homes, two of which will be live/work units. Many of the residents who will live in the homes were present at the event as well.

Vice Chair Barber requested additional information on the terms that apply to Habitat for Humanity's homes. Caroline Cozzi, representing Habitat for Humanity of Broward, explained that most families who qualify for Habitat's homes earn 60% to 80% of the area median income (AMI). While they pay a mortgage, down payments are eliminated. Prospective homeowners typically spend up to 18 months in Habitat's financial literacy and other programs. They also spend roughly 200 hours physically building their and their neighbors' homes. The mortgage for Habitat's homes is less than 30% of families' incomes.

Chair Nothard requested clarification of the average monthly mortgage payment for a four-bedroom home. Ms. Cozzi estimated that this may be approximately \$1600/month. A household earning 60% of the County's AMI may make between \$50,000 and \$90,000, depending upon the size of the family.

Ms. Wilkinson added that the City contributed \$1 million in HOME funds toward BBI Village, and will provide infrastructure funding as well. Broward County also contributed to the project.

The following Item was taken out of order on the Agenda.

IV. NEW BUSINESS

- **Update from SHIP Conference – Leann Barber & Susan Spragg**

Vice Chair Barber stated that the recent State Housing Initiatives Partnership (SHIP) conference was excellent, providing opportunities to attend several different meetings. Her key takeaway was that every county is doing something different to address affordable housing. She attended a housing expo which featured a 493 sq. ft. manufactured house for \$100,000 as well as an 1100 sq. ft. three-bedroom manufactured house, both provided by Champion Homes.

Vice Chair Barber continued that the conference's keynote speaker addressed the need to avoid gentrification in communities, focusing instead on redevelopment from within. Additional presentations were made by representatives of the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) as well as from agencies throughout the state of Florida.

Vice Chair Barber pointed out that other Florida counties appeared to be spending significantly more to address affordable housing. She continued that she would like to see an inventory of Broward County's existing affordable housing stock by age and level of affordability, and to determine whether or not the manufactured homes displayed at the conference could be adapted as ADUs in Fort Lauderdale.

Chair Nothard suggested that a list of state-approved builders who construct prefabricated units could be compiled, which could help expedite the process. Ms. Wilkinson confirmed that she and other City Staff members have seen some of these manufactured homes, and are interested in using one-bedroom units as ADUs.

Mr. Calvo arrived at 9:31 a.m.

Ms. Wilkinson continued that Fort Lauderdale's Community Redevelopment Agency (CRA) still has a small number of empty lots which may be suitable for affordable housing. Chair Nothard suggested that there may also be opportunities to work with the builders of prefabricated units, as well as with general contractors and land use attorneys who may be able to volunteer their time, creating a package of how affordable units may be implemented.

Ms. Wilkinson noted that the City is working on a separate strategy through which they may be able to provide funds through the SHIP program toward manufactured homes. She clarified that the ADUs under consideration by the City would be true affordable housing in perpetuity. The City would bear the cost of providing the manufactured unit as long as it is used for affordable housing.

Ms. Spragg asked if the City might be able to implement a multi-bedroom manufactured unit on a CRA-owned lot and then add a smaller manufactured ADU as well. Ms. Wilkinson replied that this would depend upon the size of the lot.

Vice Chair Barber stated that the three-bedroom manufactured units would be appropriate for infill projects on CRA lots, and recommended that the CRA consider this option. Ms. Wilkinson pointed out that the CRA is not in the business of creating affordable housing, as they are more likely to give their available lots to nonprofit entities for development. It was also noted that the CRA is scheduled to sunset in 2025.

Vice Chair Barber added that she would also like to know what policies are currently in place in Fort Lauderdale and Broward County with regard to affordable housing concessions. She explained that her concern was with the ongoing development of market-rate housing without an affordable component, and asked where any payments in lieu for those developments may have gone. Ms. Wilkinson stated that a portion of payments in lieu will go into the Affordable Housing Trust Fund in the future. This payment is \$10,000 per unit, which is the same for both the City and the County.

Ms. Spragg, who also attended the SHIP conference, advised that she had attended a forum on faith-based organizations that build affordable housing. They also enter into partnerships with various community organizations. One of these local entities is partnering with the Urban League to build on surplus church land in another Broward city, which the Committee has discussed. She plans to meet with a representative of the organization to find out more information. Chair Nothard recommended that the Committee revisit this issue at a later date to find out more information.

Ms. Wilkinson advised that ties with local churches' properties have not been fully taken advantage of in the City. She recalled that Fort Lauderdale works closely with Community Housing Development Organizations (CHDOs), as their mission is to work with properties that are dedicated in perpetuity to affordable housing. She pointed out that the City plans to provide one of these organizations with a CRA-owned lot on which they can develop affordable housing for senior citizens. Only registered CHDOs may enter into these types of agreements.

Ms. Spragg continued that she also attended a session on community development financing institutions, which are private entities which lend money to projects. She noted that one of these entities included a focus on the racial equity impact of their development. She concluded that she could provide a more comprehensive report at the next Committee meeting.

Chair Nothard advised that the next SHIP conference is scheduled for August 27-29, 2024. She hoped there will be opportunities for a Committee member or members to attend next year's event.

V. AGENDA TOPICS FOR NEXT MEETING

Ms. Wilkinson stated that the public hearing for the Affordable Housing Incentive Plan is scheduled for the Committee's October 9, 2023 meeting. She emphasized that this will be the main focus of the October meeting.

Ms. Spragg commented that she had not been aware the Committee was considering increasing the proposed size of ADUs from 600 sq. ft. to 750 sq. ft. Chair Nothard explained that she had felt this was worth consideration for next year, but had not necessarily meant this change should be included in the current recommendations of the Affordable Housing Incentive Plan. She noted that in some parts of the U.S., ADU size has been increased up to 1200 sq. ft., and this may be a future consideration.

Vice Mayor Dr. Beasley-Pittman arrived at 10:10 a.m. It was noted she had been in attendance at the City's September 11 memorial event.

Ms. Wilkinson asked that the members send any comments on the 2023 Affordable Housing Incentive Plan to her office so she can include them prior to the October 9, 2023 public hearing.

Ms. Wilkinson continued that another workshop at the recent SHIP conference had focused on heir properties, noting that the ownership of these properties can be unclear. She stated that she has reached out to other entities for additional information and hopes to schedule a community workshop on this issue. This is of particular concern when property owners do not have a will clearly delineating ownership and court issues ensue. Chair Nothard confirmed that this could also be an Agenda Item for a future meeting.

Sister Merrill asked if it would be possible for a nonprofit entity which owns land to place a manufactured unit on that property to demonstrate this option. It was clarified that a nonprofit may take this step using its own funds. Ms. Wilkinson emphasized the importance of the City working with nonprofit entities such as churches, which may own significant parcels of land that could be used for affordable housing. CHDOs may also partner with nonprofit organizations.

Sister Merrill asked how large a parcel of land might be required for a three-bedroom manufactured unit with a separate ADU. Chair Nothard advised that this may be more of a question of the jurisdiction of this site: for example, other Broward cities may have different minimum ADU sizes than Fort Lauderdale. Zoning issues will also affect this type of development. Ms. Wilkinson added that the City's Building Department would also need to be consulted with regard to manufactured units.

Chair Nothard stated that the Miami Center for Architecture and Design (AIA Miami) plans to hold a competition in October 2023 for ADUs. This can provide examples of how ADUs may be constructed and/or implemented.

Vice Mayor Dr. Beasley-Pittman recalled that prefabricated homes were implemented in the Rock Island community several years ago, and many are still standing and have been enhanced. She pointed out that the City and County are already aware of manufactured units as an option.

VI. GOOD OF THE ORDER

- **AHAC / City Commission Joint Meeting – October 17, 2023**

Mr. Calvo recommended that the Committee review the parameters and purpose of their upcoming joint workshop with the City Commission so they can make the most of this opportunity.

Vice Mayor Dr. Beasley-Pittman noted that she will need clarification of whether she should participate in the joint workshop as a Committee member or as part of the City Commission. She added that she felt the Committee is going in the right direction.

Ms. Wilkinson characterized the joint workshop as an open forum in which the Committee members may raise certain issues they would like to discuss in relation to affordable housing. She recommended that the members bring any backup information they felt was pertinent to these issues.

Ms. Spragg suggested that the 2023 Affordable Housing Incentive Plan's recommendations will make a strong starting point, as the current City Commission may not have had prior interaction with the Committee. Ms. Wilkinson pointed out that the City is in need of new funding for the Affordable Housing Trust Fund, as other funds, such as SHIP and HOME funds, are restricted in how they may be used.

Vice Chair Barber observed that the Committee needs to determine metrics by which achievements toward affordable housing can be measured, such as development of a specific number of affordable units by a set date, or performance indicators for initiatives such as expedited permitting. Chair Nothard suggested that the Committee look at cities which have established these metrics and provide this information to the Commission. She asked that Vice Chair Barber bring this issue to the Commission at the joint workshop.

Vice Mayor Dr. Beasley-Pittman added that the Committee should also review any benchmarks implemented at the County level, and how close the City comes to meeting these benchmarks.

Sr. Merrill stated that she was very concerned with the payment in lieu amount of \$10,000, which she felt should be closer to \$100,000. She proposed that the Committee discuss increasing the payment in lieu, and showing the Commission an example of a manufactured ADU.

Ms. Wilkinson explained that SHIP funds include mandates for the spending of those dollars: for example, 65% of SHIP money must go toward home ownership, while other percentages must be used for construction, households with low to extremely low incomes, and other specific SHIP requirements. Because of these mandates, other funds, such as program incomes, could be used toward efforts such as rapid re-housing.

Sr. Merrill asked if it would be possible to increase the payment in lieu amount from \$10,000 to \$100,000. Vice Mayor Dr. Beasley-Pittman advised that when this amount was approved as part of the City's initiative, she had asked a question of why the required percentage of affordable units could not be, for example, 30% instead of 10%. Mr. Calvo pointed out that if either of these requirements were increased, the development community would most likely take the issue to the State Legislature, resulting in preemption. An increase would also most likely damage the City's and County's relationships with the development, banking, and construction communities.

Sr. Merrill emphasized the need to do better in the face of this type of response. She did not believe the community should be oppressed by potential opposition, and should seek a way to increase this amount.

Vice Chair Barber pointed out that increasing luxury housing exacerbates the affordable housing crisis, as the addition of luxury units generates an even greater demand on services. She felt the Committee should point this out to the Commission.

Chair Nothard suggested that the Committee clearly communicate the challenge of affordable housing to the City Commission, including the shortfall of funding from current sources. She added that the Committee has also discussed potential new sources of income, which should be reviewed for the Commission as well.

Mr. Calvo stated that while he agreed with Sr. Merrill's concerns, he recommended caution when recommending changes, advising once more that the existing supermajority in both houses of state government could result in preemption. He proposed suggesting additional incentives instead, such as changes in tax obligations, density, parking, and other considerations.

Vice Chair Barber concluded that she was in favor of showing what other counties have accomplished to generate more money for affordable housing, citing Miami-Dade County as one example.

VII. NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING DATE – October 9, 2023 – Public Hearing for Affordable Housing Incentive Plan

Ms. Wilkinson reiterated that the Committee will vote on the final 2023 Affordable Housing Incentive Plan at their October 9, 2023 meeting, which will be presented to the City Commission on their October 17, 2023 Agenda.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Committee at this time, the meeting was adjourned at 10:38 a.m.

Any written public comments made 48 hours prior to the meeting regarding items discussed during the proceedings have been attached hereto.

[Minutes prepared by K. McGuire, Prototype, Inc.]